

Office of the Attorney General State of Texas

DAN MORALES ATTORNEY GENERAL

November 24, 1998

Ms. Mary Keller Senior Associate Commissioner Legal and Compliance Division Texas Department of Insurance 333 Guadalupe Street Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR98-2855

Dear Ms. Keller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Texas Open Records Act, chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 119791.

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received a request for complaints relating to International Surety and Casualty Company. You claim that much of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by constitutional or common-law privacy and under certain circumstances excepts from disclosure private facts about individuals. Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd., 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976), cert. denied, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). Information must be withheld from public disclosure under a commonlaw right of privacy when the information is (1) highly intimate and embarrassing such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) there is no legitimate public interest in its disclosure. *Id.* at 685; Open Records Decision No. 611 at 1 (1992). Financial information about private individuals is the type of information that may be protected under common-law privacy. Open Records Decision No. 373 at 3 (1983). The submitted documents consist of premium finance agreements and consumer protection records containing private financial information. The premium finance agreements must be de-identified to protect the individuals' common-law privacy interests. We also agree that much of the financial information you have marked must be withheld under common-law privacy as well. We have bracketed the information that is not protected under section 552.101 and must be released.

You also seek to withhold social security numbers under section 552.101. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. See id. We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the submitted documents are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.353 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Finally, you claim that some of the submitted documents are excepted from disclosure under section 552.111. Section 552.111 excepts "an interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency." In Open Records Decision No. 615 (1993), this office reexamined the predecessor to the section 552.111 exception in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ), and held that section 552.111 excepts only those internal communications consisting of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. An agency's policymaking functions, however, do not encompass internal administrative or personnel matter; disclosure of information relating to such matters will not inhibit free discussion among agency personnel as to policy issues. Open Records Decision No. 615 at 5-6 (1993). In addition, section 552.111 does not except from disclosure purely factual information that is severable from the opinion portions of internal memoranda. *Id.* at 4-5. After reviewing the submitted memoranda, we conclude that they are not excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 and must be released.

We are resolving this matter with an informal letter ruling rather than with a published open records decision. This ruling is limited to the particular records at issue under the facts presented to us in this request and should not be relied on as a previous determination regarding any other records. If you have any questions regarding this ruling, please contact our office.

Yours very truly,

June B. Harden

Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

Ref.: ID# 119791

Enclosures: Marked documents

cc: Ms. Barbara D. Carney

Cokinos, Bosien & Young

1500 Liberty Tower 2919 Allen Parkway Houston, Texas 77019

(w/o enclosures)